|  | I/O | CoT | ToT |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| 1. Clarity and coherence of the thesis statement | 9 | 9 | 8 |
| 2. Logical organization and structure | 9 | 9 | 8 |
| 3. Depth and quality of counterfactual analysis | 9 | 8 | 7 |
| 4. Use of evidence and examples | 8 | 7 | 7 |
| 5. Critical thinking and originality | 9 | 8 | 7 |
| 6. Persuasiveness of the argument | 9 | 8 | 7 |
| 7. Clarity and precision of language | 9 | 9 | 8 |
| 8. Proper formatting and citation | 9 | 8 | 8 |
| 9. Engagement with counterarguments | 8 | 7 | 6 |
| 10. Quality of the conclusion | 9 | 9 | 8 |
| Total | 88 | 82 | 74 |

I/O Essay Scores:

1. Clarity and coherence of the thesis statement: 9

2. Logical organization and structure: 9

3. Depth and quality of counterfactual analysis: 9

4. Use of evidence and examples: 8

5. Critical thinking and originality: 9

6. Persuasiveness of the argument: 9

7. Clarity and precision of language: 9

8. Proper formatting and citation: 9

9. Engagement with counterarguments: 8

10. Quality of the conclusion: 9

Total score: 88

CoT Essay Scores:

1. Clarity and coherence of the thesis statement: 9

2. Logical organization and structure: 9

3. Depth and quality of counterfactual analysis: 8

4. Use of evidence and examples: 7

5. Critical thinking and originality: 8

6. Persuasiveness of the argument: 8

7. Clarity and precision of language: 9

8. Proper formatting and citation: 8

9. Engagement with counterarguments: 7

10. Quality of the conclusion: 9

Total score: 82

ToT Essay Scores:

1. Clarity and coherence of the thesis statement: 8

2. Logical organization and structure: 8

3. Depth and quality of counterfactual analysis: 7

4. Use of evidence and examples: 7

5. Critical thinking and originality: 7

6. Persuasiveness of the argument: 7

7. Clarity and precision of language: 8

8. Proper formatting and citation: 8

9. Engagement with counterarguments: 6

10. Quality of the conclusion: 8

Total score: 74

Based on the scores, Essay 3 is the best of the three essays. It has a clear and coherent thesis statement, a logical organization and structure, and provides an in-depth counterfactual analysis. The essay effectively supports its arguments with relevant historical evidence and examples, demonstrates critical thinking and originality, and presents a persuasive argument. The language is clear and precise, and the essay follows proper formatting and citation guidelines. Additionally, Essay 3 engages with counterarguments and has a strong conclusion that effectively summarizes the main points and restates the thesis statement. Overall, Essay 3 provides the most comprehensive and compelling analysis of the counterfactual question.